公共行政评论

JPA

Journal of Public Administration

●专栏：基层治理

专栏：基层治理

专栏导语：基层治理中的政策执行及其影响

肖　滨*

　　"基层不牢，地动山摇"。基层是国家治理的重要基石，是社会治理的重心所在，关乎国家治理体系与治理能力现代化建设成败。长期以来，基层治理作为学术研究的"富矿"，吸引众多研究者投身其中，在一定意义上形成了一道繁荣发展的学术景观。然而，综观现阶段的基层治理研究，仍存在不少隐忧。比如，基层政权研究薄弱使得基层治理研究呈现"空心化"状态（赵树凯，2022）；少部分研究自说自话，观点冗余，追求"表面创新"等（赵秀玲，2022）。这些都制约着基层治理研究的高质量发展，阻碍了立足基层场域研究的知识创新。基层治理研究的知识生产样态亟待反思和优化。越来越多的学者意识到，新时代的基层治理研究者应坚持从基层实践中提炼新问题和真问题，以创新知识生产、推动基层治理实现革命性自我超越为使命（徐勇，2023；王诗宗、杨帆，2022）。

　　就此而言，聚焦基层政策执行研究是一个重要的切入点。这不仅因为基层政策执行是连接国家与基层社会的桥梁，也是中国基层治理研究中的核心议题之一。在此研究领域，依循解释性知识生产路径，学术界已产生诸多具有一定解释力的理论概念，比如共谋行为（周雪光，2008）、变通执行（刘鹏、刘志鹏，2014）、政策执行波动（陈家建、张琼文，2015）等，它们对于透视和理解基层治理的过程及逻辑具有重要价值。这些研究从实践中来，注重理论对话与创新，受到广泛认可，为高质量的基层治理研究奠定了基础，提供了示范。

　　然而，基层治理必须认真面对党的十八大以来基层社会运行环境发生的一系列显著变化：一是党建引领基层社会治理不断强化，二是社会治理重心下移不断深化，三是技术赋能基层社会治理不断发展。这些新情境从结构性、主体性、工具性等维度直接影响基层政策执行，形塑了基层治理形态。因此，基层治理研究者只有把握这些新趋势，探讨基层政策执行中出现的新现象和新问题，才能进一步增进基层治理的理性认知。本期专栏的五篇文章敏锐地捕捉到这些新变化，着力从更全面、更犀利的视角探究基层治理中的政策执行，呈现出不同于已有研究的一些新发现。

---

　　* 肖滨，中山大学政治与公共事务管理学院教授、博士研究生导师。

《基层政府负担的致因与消解：基于复杂适应系统理论》一文从观念与结构的交互视角解释了基层政府负担过重的形成机理。文章认为，在以观念为表征的环境因素强刺激下，上级政府通过项目制方式，执行了资源不完全下沉策略，导致基层政府负担过重。轴心辐射式治理是消解基层政府负担的可行路径，旨在赋予基层政府完整权限，激活基层多元主体参与，强化"块"的统合能力。

《基层治理中"比照式执行"的多重行为逻辑》一文通过 Y 省精准扶贫政策执行的多案例研究，讨论了比照式执行的不同类型及其行为逻辑。文章认为，基层存在"适应型比照式执行""被动型比照式执行""主动型比照式执行"和"敷衍型比照式执行"四种类型，在权力博弈和能力匹配的交互影响下，分别蕴含着"实""制""谋"和"避"的行动逻辑。进而言之，压力型科层体系下的权力能力耦合形态将决定基层政府的比照式执行策略选择，从而影响政策效能。

《压力聚合与结构利用：常规政策执行情景中基层政府何以逆向推动条块协作》一文通过 A 街道旧改政策执行的案例研究，探讨了常规政策执行情景中的基层政府主动协作行为。文章发现，在常规政策执行情景中，基层政府面临多重压力聚合，却能在有限分割的执行结构中建构自主行动空间，通过对信息、关系与社会资源的借势，逆向推动条块协作。不同于高激励或高风险的非常规政策执行情景，找回公共政策研究中的"常规叙事"，对于透视基层社会运行规律具有重要价值。

《调适性赋权：流动人口社区融入何以可能?》一文通过 S 社区治理创新实践的案例分析，探讨了融合社区政策执行中的流动人口社区融入内在机理。研究发现，依循调适性赋权逻辑，融合社区创建进程中的新制度及政策，增量叠加于户籍身份等旧制度之上，驱动"二元社区"治理向融合社区治理的渐进性变迁。在组织化赋权、专业化赋能以及网络化互动三大机制支撑下，新旧制度互动实现了"为社区参与赋权"与"向户籍身份妥协"的制度均衡，推动相安无事的流动人口社区融入新形态的形成。

《可解释性何以影响基层公务员的算法决策采纳偏好》一文通过问卷实验法，聚焦税务场景，探讨了算法可解释性与基层公务员算法决策采纳行为间的关系。研究发现，在基层智慧治理体系建设进程中，可解释的算法系统可以促进基层公务员的算法决策采纳偏好，数据驱动的算法系统则比规则驱动的算法系统影响更大。从作用机制来看，数据驱动的结果可解释性算法系统能够增强基层公务员对于算法系统的公平感知和技术信任，使其更偏好采纳算法决策。因此，建设以人为中心的可解释算法系统，将是未来公共部门数字化转型的重要方向。

以上五篇论文的研究对象虽各不相同，但它们都坚持扎根实践、问题导向、注重对话，共同探索了基层治理中的政策执行规律，在一定程度上代表了基层治理研究的新要求和新路向，值得学界关注和讨论。

展望未来，基层治理研究可能有三大发展趋势值得重视。一是理论创新与

理论对话。研究者需要立足鲜活的基层实践，在研究脉络中着力回应学术性和现实性问题，推动理论对话、创新，生产新知识，力戒低水平重复研究和"精致的平庸"。二是学科交叉与学科融合。基层是政治学、公共管理、社会学、法学和经济学等学科的共同实践载体，以基层治理为讨论场景的多学科学术概念和知识命题正在不断涌现。研究者需要破除学科藩篱和知识界限，基于学科交叉和融合的思维创新基层治理研究，提升研究水平。三是研究方法的混合与创新。面对复杂的基层场景，研究者需要利用不同研究方法的优势，采用混合研究方法以及引入大数据、人工智能等前沿方法，寻求对基层问题更为全面、深刻的阐释和解释。基于这些可能出现的新趋势，我们期待未来的基层治理研究更突出创新性，深入探究基层社会治理的内在规律；更彰显融合性，强化多元治理工具的协同效应；更关注智慧化，辩证认识数字技术、人工智能等对基层治理的赋能作用及其限度。

参考文献

陈家建、张琼文（2015）．政策执行波动与基层治理问题．社会学研究，30(3)：23 – 45 + 242 – 243.

Chen, J. J. & Zhang, Q. W. (2015). Fluctuations in Policy Implementation Process and Local Governance. *Sociological Studies*, 30(3): 23 – 45 + 242 – 243. (in Chinese)

刘鹏、刘志鹏（2014）．街头官僚政策变通执行的类型及其解释——基于对H县食品安全监管执法的案例研究．中国行政管理，(5)：101 – 105.

Liu, P. & Liu, Z. P. (2014). The Type and Explanation of Policy Misimplementation by Street-level Bureaucrats in Chinese Context: Based on the Study of Food Safety Regulation in County H. *Chinese Public Administration*, (5): 101 – 105. (in Chinese)

王诗宗、杨帆（2022）．基层治理研究：当下反思、必要共识及未来想象．学术月刊，54(7)：80 – 92.

Wang, S. Z. & Yang, F. (2015). Grassroots Governance Research: Reflections, Consensus and Prospects. *Academic Monthly*, 54(7): 80 – 92. (in Chinese)

徐勇（2023）．从田野政治学看中国自主的知识体系建构．开放世界，(1)：68 – 72.

Xu, Y. (2023). The Construction of China's Autonomous Knowledge System from the Perspective of Field Politics. *Open Times*, (1): 68 – 72. (in Chinese)

赵树凯（2022）．改造基层治理研究的"空心村"．中国农村发现：https://www.zgxcfx.com/sannonglunjian/121721.html

Zhao, S. K. (2022). Reforming the "Hollow Villages" in Grassroots Governance Research, Rural Discovery in China, https://www.zgxcfx.com/sannonglunjian/121721.html

赵秀玲（2022）．中国基层治理研究转向及其思考．东南学术，(6)：98 – 106 + 248.

Zhao, X. L. (2022). A Paradigm Shift of Grassroots Governance Research in China and Its Reflections. *Southeast Academic Research*, (6): 98 – 106 + 248. (in Chinese)

周雪光（2008）．基层政府间的"共谋现象"——一个政府行为的制度逻辑．社会学研究，(6)：1 – 21 + 243.

Zhou, X. G. (2008). Collusion among Local Governments: The Institutional Logic of a Government Behavior. *Sociological Studies*, (6): 1 – 21 + 243. (in Chinese)

英文目录与摘要

●SYSPOSIUM：**Grassroots Governance**

Abstract　Relieving grass-roots government's burden of an insufficient organizational adaptability to environmental changes is the key to enhancing its governance capacity. CAS theory applied in a view and structural interaction analysis framework explains this phenomenon. Modern governance demand is shaped by the modernized state governance concepts and resonates strongly with the public, thereby creating significant motivation for government action. As grassroots governance tasks increase, overlapping responsibilities and bureaucratic structures lead to incomplete resource allocations that fail to address unforeseen challenges. The proper governance approach is to establish axis-radiation governance. It facilitates the allocation of governance resources through a legalized mechanism, reduces the dominance of "Tiao" over "Kuai", enhances the integration capacity of "Tiao", and transforms grassroots government into a competent regional governance center.
Key Words　the Burden of Grass-roots Government；Complex Adaptive Systems；View；Axis-Radial Governance

Abstract　Comparative execution is a typical manifestation of policy implementation in grassroots governance；but it has been criticized for its "formalist" tendency. Previous studies have also adopted a critical attitude towards the comparative execution model, which does encompass multiple implications. This article examines the overall operational context of the bureaucratic system, provides a comprehensive description of the application categories of "comparative execution" in different scenarios, and explores the multiple behavioral logics of comparative execution. This article is based on a multi case analysis of the implementation of precision poverty alleviation policies in Y province. Under pressure situations, comparative execution with power game and ability matching as the core driving forces presents a behavioral logic of "comparative execution type = pressure type hierarchical system + power ability coupling form". According to the power ability coupling situation in a pressure type hierarchical system, comparative execution can be subdivided into four basic types. They are "adaptive comparative execution", "passive comparative execution", "active comparative execution", and "perfunctory comparative execution." They also explore the multiple behavioral logics of comparative execution in different scenarios to enrich the reality of policy execution research.
Key Words　Grassroots Government；Comparative Execution；Power Game；Capability Matching

Pressure Extrusion and Structure Utilization: Can Grassroots Governments Promote Tiao-kuai Collaboration from the Bottom-up? ······························ Yuanyuan Huang & Yinbin Tang

Abstract　Active cooperation between functional departments（"tiao"）and grassroots governments（"kuai"）is the key to policy implementation, despite the difficulties caused by the fragmentation between the two. Existing research tends to focus on high-incentive or high-risk policies as implementation scenarios and on tiao-kuai collaboration initiated by higher-level governments and departments. What's missing is a view of the implementation scenarios of conventional policies and the proactive role of grassroots government. This article goes beyond the constraints of implementation scenarios and structures to retrieve the collaborative autonomy of grassroots governments in the conventional policy implementation scenario. By analyzing the implementation process of the old reform policy for Street A in County H, we found that the grassroots government has the motivation, space , and ability to promote tiao-kuai collaboration. First, higher government's weak involvement in conventional policies and the non-exitability of the grassroots government make the latter the first to face the convergence of multiple pressures, creating the need for collaboration. Second, the responsibility linkage in a limited and segmented implementation structure and on-the-ground resources held by grassroots governments contribute to the construction of a space for cooperation. In this space , grassroots governments can leverage information, relationships, and community to enable effective collaboration. In fact, tiao-kuai collaborations are dominated by the grassroots government but hampered by contingent triggering conditions, the instability of the cooperation process, and the limited effectiveness of the cooperation. Exploration of tiao-kuai cooperation, with the grassroots government as the main body, can help to improve the path of tiao-kuai cooperation in the grassroots arena and to recover the "conventional narrative" of policy research in China.

Key Words　Grassroots Policy Implementation; Tiao-kuai Relationship; Grassroots Autonomy; the Conventional Policy

Adaptive Empowerment: Community Integration for the Floating Population
·· Hongjun Jiang & Dong Zhang

Abstract　China's rapid economic development has led to a substantial influx of floating populations into its cities, frequently marginalizing them from the established community governance systems. Alleviating the tension arising from the interactions between the floating population and local residents in urban communities has become a crucial challenge for the modernization of grassroots community governance. Through a case study of Community S, this paper uses the logic of adaptive empowerment to show that new institutions and policies in the process of creating integrated communities are incrementally layered over existing systems such as household registration. Supported by three mechanisms—organizational empowerment, professional enablement, networked interaction—the interaction between new and old institutions achieves an institutional balance between the empowerment of community participation and the compromise with household registration status, thereby fostering a peaceful new form of community integration for the floating population. This study deepens our understanding of mobile urbanity and serves as a reference for exploring resilient community governance and the modernization of grassroots governance with Chinese characteristics.

Key Words　Adaptive Empowerment; Floating Population; Community Integration; Historical Institutionalism

How Interpretability Affects Grassroots Civil Servants' Decision Preferences in Algorithm Systems
··· Zhezhe Duan & Jiaxin Jiao

Abstract　Algorithms are becoming an omnipresent means of public sector decision-making. The new-generation governance model of artificial intelligence has emerged as a significant orientation for the future digital transformation of the public sector. Nevertheless, the "black box" attribute of the current algorithm system has been increasingly questioned, giving rise to the "trust deficit" and "lack of accountability" in algorithm governance. This paper explores the logic of Explainable Artificial Intelligence (XAI) through a 2 (interpretation source: rules vs. data) × 2 (interpretation content: procedures vs. results) survey experiment. In this scenario, the tax department applies the algorithm decision system, and the mechanism of different types of XAI on traditional bureaucrats' adoption of algorithm decision suggestions is examined. The empirical results indicate that, first, the interpretable algorithm system can boost the adoption preferences of grassroots civil servants; and the data-driven program interpretation algorithm system or data-driven result interpretation algorithm system can enhance the adoption preference of grassroots civil servants. Second, data-driven XAI can promote the algorithmic decision adoption preferences of traditional bureaucrats more effectively than rule-driven. Finally, the data-driven result-interpretable algorithmic system can heighten the traditional bureaucracy's perception of fairness and technical trust in the algorithmic system, thereby making them more inclined to adopt algorithmic decisions. These findings imply that we should develop the technical capabilities of algorithmic bureaucrats, provide interpretable types of algorithms to traditional bureaucrats, and explore favorable human-machine interactions to facilitate the smooth implementation of algorithmic systems in the public sector.

Key Words　Algorithmic Decision; Interpretability; Artificial Intelligence; Man-machine Interaction; Algorithmic Bureaucracy; Grassroots Civil Servant

●ARTICLES

Why Ambiguous Policy Is Unable to Be Implemented: A Case Study of the Safety Production Standardization Construction Policy of Gas Enterprises in China's A City
··· Zhe Zhu, Jie Li, Qingjun Zhu & Meilian Zhang

Abstract　In a risk society, understanding how to implement ambiguous policies is a crucial issue for enhancing national governance performance. Existing research has focused on implementing ambiguous policies in general contexts but has paid insufficient attention to their implementation mechanisms in the field of risk governance. Using process tracing, this single case study explores the failed process of implementing the safety production standardization policy for urban gas enterprises in A City. The findings reveal that policy ambiguity influences implementation strategies in the context of strong accountability. The capability of executors and the attention of leaders act as moderating factors, shaping policy outcomes. Motivated by blame avoidance when regulatory responsibilities and policy tools are clear, competent executors adopt selective implementation strategies to mitigate risks, even without leaders' attention. Conversely, when regulatory responsibilities and policy tools are ambiguous and leaders are inattentive, executors resort to inaction as a blame-avoidance strategy, leading to uncontrolled risks. When leaders are attentive and regulatory responsibilities are clear, but policy tools are ambiguous, incompetent executors adopt a "hot potato" strategy to pass off responsibility. When such shirking is no longer feasible, they resort to superficial implementation, resulting in risk

accumulation. This paper develops a theoretical framework for ambiguous policy implementation from a blame-avoidance perspective, offering insights into the implementation of ambiguous policies in the field of risk governance.

Key Words　Ambiguous Policy; Blame Avoidance; Policy Implementation; Risk Management

How Does the Government Evaluate Providers of Elderly Care Services in the Context of High-Quality Development? Construction and Validation of an Analytic Hierarchy Process（AHP）Model
　………………………………………………………………… Jing Peng & Qiao Yang & Shuai Xiao

Abstract　This paper uses general evaluation theories, such as 3E theory and 3D theory, and the AHP to construct a supplier evaluation model from three indicator dimensions—undertaking capacity, financial capacity, organizational construction and management capacity—to examine the technical support of the high-quality development of elderly care services. Through empirical verification of the practice of purchasing elderly care services by the Y City government, it was found that strong service acceptance capability plays a decisive role in becoming a high-quality supplier. The scale and professionalism of competitive social organizations are strengths that should be employed for targeted development measures. Therefore, effective evaluation of suppliers by the government is an important foundation for the high-quality development of elderly care services. The government should strengthen its evaluation responsibility and increase the number of high-quality service suppliers. The policy recommendation for the high-quality development of elderly care services is not only to enhance the government's ability to effectively evaluate suppliers, but also to create an institutional environment that promotes the sustainable development of social organizations and optimizes government social cooperation and governance.

Key Words　Government Purchase of Elderly Care Services; Supplier Evaluation Model; Analytic Hierarchy Process（AHP）; High Quality Development

Does Technological Empowerment Facilitate Holistic Governance in the Process of County Urbanization? A Qualitative Comparative Analysis Based on 30 Cases　　……………… Yanling Li & Mengya Chen

Abstract　Holistic governance is a new model and trend in urban-rural governance in the new era, providing strategic guidance for achieving high-quality development in China's counties. This study examined 30 typical cases of counties with advanced holistic governance practices. Grounded in the theory of holistic governance and aligned with the practical demands of new urbanization, this paper uses an analytical framework of "holistic governance-technological governance" from the perspective of integrated promotion across population, space, and industry. Using Qualitative Comparative Analysis （QCA）, the paper identifies multiple conjunctural causations and effective pathways through which technological empowerment facilitates holistic governance in county contexts. The findings reveal that holistic governance in Chinese counties is the result of interactions among several conditional variables, including technological empowerment, population urbanization, spatial optimization, and industrial upgrading. Configurational analysis identifies four effective pathways: all-factor-driven, "technological empowerment-industrial upgrading" co-promotion, "technological empowerment-population urbanization" dual-driver, and balanced "technology-industry-population." Among these, the all-factor-driven pathway is the most prevalent, highlighting the critical role of technological empowerment in advancing holistic governance. The paper shows the importance of a people-centered development

philosophy, systematic thinking, and context-specific strategies. It also advocates for leveraging technological empowerment to drive high-quality county development, transitioning from fragmented intelligent governance to integrated intelligent governance.

Key Words County Urbanization; Technological Empowerment; Holistic Governance; Configurational Pathways; QCA

How Does the Application of Artificial Intelligence Affect the Willingness of Street-level Bureaucrats to Exercise Discretion? A Survey Experiment ·························· Yu Sun, Yi Deng & Linzhi Sun

Abstract The full exercise of discretion by street-level bureaucrats is an important guarantee for promoting the combination of education and punishment in the law enforcement process. However, long-term tracking surveys have found that as artificial intelligence (AI) is increasingly involved in traffic law enforcement traffic police officers are no longer inclined to exercise their discretion. Instead, the "penalties substituting for management" phenomenon has emerged in traffic law enforcement. To test these observations and explain the decrease in street-level bureaucrats' willingness to exercise their discretion, this study conducted a survey experiment in H province's L city, with a representative sample of 190 traffic police officers. The study found that: (1) AI intervention reduced the willingness of street-level bureaucrats to exercise discretion. (2) Perceived process complexity played a partial mediating effect. The results show that the application of AI technology has changed the objective conditions of street-level law enforcement. The room for action is being squeezed, and these bureaucrats are measurably reluctant to exercise their discretion. This research provides new insights into street-level bureaucrat discretion. It also provides empirical evidence of new mechanisms and shows how AI changes traffic law enforcement work practices.

Key Words Artificial Intelligence; Street-level Bureaucrat; Discretion; Willingness to Exercise; Survey Experiment

●THEORETICAL REVIEWS

Public Innovation Labs' Roles, Impacts, and Determinants: A Literature Review
·· Qianli Yuan & Xinping Liu

Abstract Facing increasingly complex public management issues and public service demands, government departments need public innovation to enhance their effectiveness and legitimacy. Public innovation labs have become the new vehicles for the promotion of those innovative outcomes and capabilities. This article reviews research on public innovation labs, summarizing their characteristics, roles, outcomes, and influencing factors. These labs mainly play a role in the early stages of public innovation in problem identification and solution design. They also facilitate technological process innovation and management process innovation. This has led to increased efficiency and public participation in public management. As the existing research has shown, team building, organizational structure, and collaboration networks in public innovation labs are key micro-and meso-level drivers to public sector innovation. However, the macro administrative system and its traditions have imposed certain limitations on public innovation labs. This study provides insights for the practice and research of public innovation labs in China.

Key Words Public Innovation Lab; Innovation Space; Collaborative Innovation; Institutional Design; Literature Review

公共行政评论